



the eastern cape
historical legacies & new challenges
conference: 27 - 30 August 2003



RHODES UNIVERSITY
East London Campus



University of Fort Hare
Together in Excellence



ST ANTONY'S COLLEGE
OXFORD UNIVERSITY

**A DREAM DEFERRED:
SOCIAL CITIZENSHIP AND SOCIAL SECURITY IN POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA
A CASE STUDY OF MOUNT FRERE, EASTERN CAPE PROVINCE**

By

Jasmine M. Waddell

Abstract

Unequal access to constitutionally endowed social security transfers for poor families in South Africa indicates the persistence of selective citizenship entitlements (Taylor, V. 2002). The re-distributive impact of cash transfers has proven to be an effective means of income maintenance in households expressing the greatest need (May, J. 1998a). Studies show that the administration of the child support grant is dependent upon adequate infrastructure, facilities, resources and outreach (Budlender, D. 1998; Zunga, S. et al. 2003). However, these factors vary widely within South Africa, especially across the rural-urban axis. This paper explores the relationship between the efficacy of social welfare grant administration and social citizenship rights in Mount Frere. The conclusions from this project inform policy discourse to the end of reducing poverty for all women and children in South Africa.

Introduction

The goal of this paper is to argue that the Mount Frere case study helps to explain the relationship between social citizenship and the efficacy of social grant administration in South Africa from the perspective of rural Black poverty. The discussion will begin with a contextual grounding in the case study location highlighting why the area was chosen as an example of challenges for the 'new' South Africa. The first section will also explain how the historical legacy of separate development impacts upon the efficacy of poverty alleviation strategies. The subsequent section will address the methodological tools and approaches employed. This case study relied upon group and elite interviews and the results of the Afrobarometer household survey.¹ The main section presents the data collected from these sources. The two main variables are broken down into component sub-variables and extrapolated both descriptively and empirically. The variables are then coded and ultimately incorporated into a Boolean analysis describing the relationship between the efficacy of social citizenship and social grant administration.² This paper concludes with a discussion of how the Mount Frere case can inform the larger South African social policy discourse. Specifically, this paper argues that Mount Frere serves as an example of how socio-demographic context and provincial location affect the social stability of poor Black citizens in the post-apartheid era.

Context

Mount Frere is the nucleus of the Umzimvubu municipality in the former Transkei homeland.³ The town includes a population of approximately 300,000 (Makan, B., Morar, R., and McIntyre, D. 1997: 3). The projected provincial Human Development Index (HDI) for the Eastern Cape in 2010 given the impact of HIV was significantly higher than other eight provinces and more than 0.1 lower than the projection without HIV infection (UNDP 1998: 27). This evidence reinforces the fact that the Mount Frere area suffers from a lack of infrastructural development, a crippling HIV/AIDS infection rate and high levels of unemployment. A 1997 study by the Health Systems Trust (HST) surveyed 614 households and 4,066 household members (Irlam, J. and McCoy, D. 1998: 7). The average size of a household, which usually comprised a number of separate dwellings, was 6.6 people (range 2 - 14) (Irlam, J. and McCoy, D. 1998: 7). Almost a third (29%) of the 16-64 year age group (n=2170) were migrants of whom 77.5% return less often than monthly (Irlam, J. and McCoy, D. 1998: 9). More than two thirds (71%) of households use water from unprotected sources (pond/ river/ stream/dam) for drinking purposes, and almost a third

¹ The national household survey was reduced to include only rural households in the Eastern Cape Province. All frequencies are derived from a data set with n=138, with one missing and all values are the valid percentage taking account of the missing variable.

² The forthcoming doctoral thesis will develop a Boolean analysis of three case study sites, Mount Frere, East London and Cape Town in Chapter Seven.

³ For a discussion of the advantages and disadvantages of the Mount Frere location see (Sogaula et al. 2002: 22-23).

(32%) take longer than half an hour to reach the nearest source of drinking water on foot (Irlam, J. and McCoy, D. 1998: 11). In addition, Mount Frere, like so many former homeland towns and municipalities, struggles to transition from corrupt and independent homeland rule to a post-apartheid re-integration into the Republic of South Africa.

Samson notes that in Mount Frere “the broader population is dispersed across rural areas, with no defined centre and thus the accessibility of transport has a dramatic effect on the ability of users to access government services” (Samson, M. 2002: 1154). Statistics on HIV/AIDS infection are difficult to obtain due to cultural taboos about having a disease stereotyped as ‘Western’ and ‘gay.’ However, poverty indicators in the region and the established relationship between poverty and morbidity indicate that the situation is very advanced.⁴

The ‘snap shot’ intake for the Child Support Grant in Mount Frere as of December 2002 was 9,588⁵ (6,000 more beneficiaries than April 2001) and climbing.⁶ A study of Mount Frere conducted in 2002 found that of thirty households affected by chronic disease and eligible for social grants, only half received them (Sogaula, N. et al. 2002: 36). However, these intake levels reflect neither eligibility nor need. According to Ms. Dekeda, the head of the Eastern Cape Welfare Department:

It might be distrust of government that leads to difficulty in reaching out to eligible populations. Can I give you an example? I grew up in a rural community in the former Transkei homeland. My mother died recently and when people came to give offerings for the funeral I asked the mothers, 'have you applied for a CSG?' and they said 'No, we heard about the grant on the radio and from friends but we thought it was just another thing for the urban areas, but not for us in the rural areas. So maybe people are not used to having grants that they could apply for and don't think that the new programs are for them in rural communities (Telephone interview, 4 September 2001: Ms. Dekeda).

This legacy thwarts efforts to reverse the negative effects of oppression.

Mount Frere was chosen as the rural area of focus for three reasons. First, it mirrors the demographic and infrastructural profile of under-developed rural African communities with historical roots in the homeland separate development policies inaugurated in by the Tomlinson Commission report in 1956. Second, the Health Systems Trust (HST) Initiative for Sub-District Support (ISDS) maintains a research centre in

⁴ In Samson (2002) there is an in depth discussion of the relationship between HIV/AIDS and income maintenance in post-apartheid Mount Frere, There are a number of research initiatives which seek to assess the relationship between HIV/AIDS infection and household income security. The article “Tracing destructive trail of virus” which appeared in the 30 May 2002 edition of *Business Week* gives a review of some of these efforts highlighting the Mount Frere study by researchers at the University of the Western Cape, the Economic Policy Research Institute (EPRI), and Oxford University.

⁵ Statistics provided by the national Department of Social Development.

⁶ Statistics provided by Mount Frere Sub-District Social Security Statistics, 2000/2001.

Mount Frere. HST has produced numerous reports on the changing demographic profile of the area and engages in local, provincial, and national activism for income maintenance and health promotion for the local service area. Therefore, there is a support network, history of research activity and reliable statistical information on Mount Frere which benefits this research project.⁷ The third reason for focusing on Mount Frere as the rural case study was the highly developed civil society and administrative infrastructure. Due to its prime location on the national road (N2) many civil society organizations and government department offices and clinics chose to locate in Mount Frere and the neighbouring towns Ntabankulu and Mount Ayliff. By living and working from the Mount Frere base, access to these resources and channels of information proved invaluable to the project.⁸

Methodology

The Mount Frere case study relied upon qualitative data collection and quantitative data analysis strategies such as elite interviews, small group interviews, and the results of a household survey to define the status of the dependent and independent variables on a binary continuum of variable presence or absence.⁹ Four small group interviews of two to twenty female participants aged eighteen and sixty and approximately twenty elite interviews were conducted between August 2001 and February 2003 to elicit information on the sub-variables. The elite interviews were conducted with provincial and local level officials from the departments of Social Development, Home Affairs, Health and Education as well as with members of civil society organizations based in or serving Mount Frere. The small groups were conducted in Xhosa by a male field researcher¹⁰ at the local offices for the departments of Home Affairs and Social Development, at a local medical clinic and at the town councillors' office.¹¹ The small groups worked from a framework of three initial questions. The three central questions were: 1) do you think that the government is committed to fighting poverty?, 2) what are your thoughts on the child support grant?, and 3) who do you depend upon for help when you are struggling financially?

Primary and secondary print sources such as newspaper articles, civil society literature, reports, and documents such as the *National Speak Out on Poverty Hearings* (1998) and the report by May (1998b) on

⁷ Moreover, there were linkages between the HST research centre and the Oxford University Department of Social Policy and Social Work at the time of the data collection which facilitated strong working relationships with government and advanced trust with interview participants.

⁸ The researcher's black skin, African American identity and Oxford University affiliation also facilitated access to government offices, civil society organizations, and private homes. See Appendix 3B for more information on how these factors contributed to the research project.

⁹ Chapter Three of the forthcoming dissertation *A Dream Deferred: Social Citizenship and Social Security in Post Apartheid South Africa* by Jasmine Waddell discusses in more detail how each sub-variable is coded.

¹⁰ While the interview moderator was not ideal because of his gender, he was chosen because of his extensive experience on field research in the area with the University of the Western Cape and the Health Systems Trust. He had been conducting household interviews on poverty and food security for the past year. In addition he was related to the chief of Mount Frere by blood and therefore knew the area very well. However, he remained approachable and active in community life through coaching youth sports teams and participating in church activities.

¹¹ Large groups of local residents sit outside of the local town councilors building in the centre of town waiting for odd job requests and selling fruits and vegetables to the staff.

the South African Participatory Poverty Assessment (SA-PPA) were used to augment and triangulate the data used to describe the dependent and independent variables in the Mount Frere case. A significant amount of research has focused on the Mount Frere area due to its high level of geographic¹² and academic¹³ accessibility therefore print resources were available for reference. Administrative records from government offices such as the district, provincial, and national offices of Home Affairs and Social Development were used to gain statistics about staffing and turn around time. Finally, the Afrobarometer household survey was analysed to triangulate dependent sub-variables such as civic engagement and social capital.

Data

The next section will discuss the results of data collected and analysed in the Mount Frere case study. The descriptive results will highlight the major themes of the data collected. Meanwhile, the empirical section explicates the coding of each dependent and independent sub-variable. The empirical results will determine the inputs for the Boolean truth table discussed in the meta-analysis.

Dependent Variable: Social Citizenship

Descriptive Results

Despite aggressive efforts by the national Department of Social Development, knowledge of the right to income security and adequate living standards were remarkably low among group interview participants. In Mount Frere attitudes towards social welfare programs such as the child support grant were ambivalent and under-developed despite significant obstacles to access.¹⁴

Furthermore, civic engagement in the form of voting, participation, and interaction with authorities was minimal as a result of poverty and the inaccessibility of local government officials.¹⁵ The singular strength of the Mount Frere case was social capital as expressed through durable familial bonds and communal networks of support and dependence despite significant strain from chronic disease and trans-

¹² Mount Frere is located on the N2, a major national road which connects Cape Town and Durban. Most major bus companies such as Greyhound and Intercape travel this route and have planned stops in Mount Frere.

¹³ The HST research centre attracts a revolving door of academics from the major universities researching rural poverty such as the University of Natal, University of the Western Cape, the University of Cape Town, Rhodes University, and Fort Hare. Affiliated academics such as Michael Samson at the Economic Policy Research Institute and Michael Noble (University of Oxford) and policy focused civil society organizations are frequent visitors as well. Therefore, Mount Frere is an area which is not foreign to the research act.

¹⁴ In the Boolean truth table, negative attitudes towards the CSG were coded as 1 and positive attitudes were coded as 0.

¹⁵ There is a substantial body of political science and human rights focused research on the relationship between poverty and civic engagement. This literature argues that the social impact of poverty and social exclusion such as inability to access transport, news media, polling stations, and transport in addition to temporal impoverishment hampers the active engagement of under-privileged populations. There is evidence to show that the lack of wealth at a household level can contribute to increased political or civic engagement (Mattes, R. et al. 2003) . Structural impediments inhibit the transfer of engagement from the private to the public realm.

provincial migration. However, this marginal strength did not counter-balance the absence of all other sub-variables relating to social citizenship.

There are two categories of obstacles for accessing the child support grant in Mount Frere—1) the administrative backlog and bureaucratic inefficiency of government departments (i.e. welfare, home affairs, health) and 2) the situation of potential applicants.

The lack of private investment reaps Mount Frere of employment potential. In Mount Frere, other than the government, a few small shops and a tree plantation, employment options are few. Many people are self-employed selling fruits, clothes, or other incidentals along the N2 or offering assistance such as collecting wood or with domestic tasks to non-poor residents. While the project did encounter a few individuals and organizations dedicated to reversing the entrenched economic under-development, progress towards this goal was minimal.¹⁶

Empirical Results

Social Capital

The Afrobarometer findings suggest that “the survival repertoires of southern African are quite limited” (Mattes, R. et al. 2003: 30). The results of questions about participation in group activities such as non-service church activities, self-help groups, local affairs organizations and groups that do things for the community were positive. For each of these variables, the majority of respondents had participated in these activities at least once or twice.¹⁷ The negative responses fell into two categories, namely, participation in commercial or job related activities and trust. These findings reinforce Mattes et al.’s claim that the social networks in South Africa are strained, for they focus on these factors. It is unsurprising that 68.6% of respondents had never participated in an commercial groups nor is it startling that 81% of people surveyed in rural Eastern Cape communities had never participated in a union. These findings elucidate dearth of economic advancement or employment opportunities in areas like Mount Frere rather than informing a discourse on social capital networks in the area. Finally, 69.3% of respondents said that ‘you can never be too careful’ about trusting others. This finding supports the group interview findings that for the Mount Frere case study there is an undercurrent of distrust overlaid by structures of communal support. This foundation of mistrust limits the efficacy of support networks for the income and social shocks which households experience.

¹⁶ The Ikhwezi Lomso Community Based organization is one example of a local initiative which aims to increase income generating opportunities for Mount Frere residents. The organization is still seeking NPO status and funding to actualize its plans.

¹⁷ 54% of respondents from rural communities in the Eastern Cape province had participated in church activities not related to services. Participation in self-help groups was claimed by 56.2% of respondents, while groups concerned with local affairs and groups concerned with the community were 67.9% and 50.5% respectively.

The Mount Frere study revealed a strong reliance on familial bonds such as a father in one case or community organizations such as the home village workers, the Red Cross and Sinosizo in others. Yet many respondents were bereft of these options and relied upon high interest money lenders in financial crises. One focus group conducted at the Mount Frere Home Affairs office demonstrated the varied nature of social networks in the case study area. One respondent reported that she relies on the home village workers who serve her administrative area when she has problems but that they “do not always respond.” Another respondent chimed in that she trusted her parents and a third pointed to an often cited problem with untrustworthy neighbours. She complained that she could not trust her neighbours because they were “not right people” and that they fuelled competition through jealousy and fighting over grants. Therefore, in the Mount Frere case social capital was assessed as fundamentally present, particularly in the form of familial ties and incipient civil society bonds are inconsistent and weak. Communal networks of dependence were present in Mount Frere, however, reliance upon these links depended on the type of people who sourced the support and their financial stability. One could therefore infer that financial stress and poverty weaken the indigenous bonds in this rural case study and forced the area poors to compete rather than cooperate.

The South African Participatory Poverty Assessment (SA-PPA) project¹⁸ found that “generally, support by community networks was infrequently mentioned by the participants in the SA-PPA, and where such support was mentioned, the tendency was for assistance in exchange for labour” (May, J. 1998b: 85). In Mount Frere, the lack of employment opportunities and the ubiquity of extreme poverty deprived poor families of this option. The SA-PPA study also found that “many of those interviewed expresses [sic] a regret that [*ubuntu*] was no longer followed and noted that *ubuntu* places an extra burden on poor families” (May, J. 1998b: 85). This extra burden in areas like Mount Frere resulted from the concentrations of poverty and as a result these households relied on other poors to smooth the income shocks of chronic illness and unemployment.

Accessibility of the Child Support Grant

The main gate-keeping mechanism for access to the social welfare grants are the requisite forms obtained from the department of Home Affairs. According to one study of households in Mount Frere “. . . failure to possess the necessary documents proved to be one of the most significant barriers to successful applications, and one of the most time-consuming impediments to overcome” (Samson, M. 2002: 1162). In 1999 IDASA notes: “the take-up rate of the Child Support Grant has been slow as a result of difficulties experienced by applicants in providing the necessary documentation . . .the current figures . . .

¹⁸ The project included a rural case study on the border between the Kwazulu-Natal and Eastern Cape provinces. While the study was weighted towards the three poorest provinces, Kwazulu Natal, the Eastern Cape and Limpopo, the Eastern Cape sites were largely urban. Chapter Five of the forthcoming dissertation *A Dream Deferred: Social Citizenship and Social Security in Post Apartheid South Africa* by Jasmine Waddell discusses how the East London township cases are more representative of this phenomenon.

[represent] only 4.1% of the targeted 3 million children” (IDASA 1999: 1). For example, the surname on the birth certificate must be the same as the name on the RTHC and if the mother dies and the child is raised from birth by a grandmother or aunt or neighbour their name will not be replaced on the birth certificate.

[The birth certificate always has the same name as surname as the clinic card] unless they are married [after the birth], because if they are married then the birth certificate will have the name of the father . . . [if they are not married] they must both come to the office. Then the woman will hand over the child to the father and there is a part there that says acknowledgement of paternity” (Interview: 15 August 2001: Ms. January-Cekiso).

This is yet another administrative hurdle for CSG applicants.

The Department of Home Affairs has service points in seven locations in and around Mount Frere, including the district office located in Mount Frere.

This district has other offices called service points. The Mount Frere district consists of six or seven offices . . . that is, Mount Frere, Qumbu, Tabankulu, Mount Ayliff, Maluti, Mount Fletcher, Umzimkulu, and Maclear . . . the regional office is in King Williams Town (Interview, 15 August 2001: Ms. January-Cekiso).

These service points are deigned to provide local citizens with access to identity documents such as birth certificates and the South African ID book.

If there is a computer in the local office, the marriage certificate, abridged birth certificate, and death certificate are all produced on site and the applicant walks out with the completed document the same day. However, the Mount Frere office lacks a computer, therefore the process take anywhere from weeks to months. Currently, the service points collect applications and “the maximum waiting period is two weeks. We go twice a month, every two weeks, we go to Umtata, we capture them, print them, and bring them back” (Interview, 15 August 2001: Ms. January-Cekiso). This process is further complicated by inadequate transportation. This process can take up to a month. The commute to and from Umtata and to and from the service points is heavily reliant upon the condition of the roads and transport. While the department has a vehicle the plethora of un-tarred roads and extreme weather conditions make the trip to Umtata very time consuming and at times impossible.

The ID book application is processed at the service point and then forwarded to the central office in Pretoria where the books are produced and then sent back to the district office for distribution to the service points. The district representative explained:

When the IDs are here if the person is in a very far out rural area we make a list of those people and give it to the chief and then we make a follow-up and arrange with the chiefs

a day to come and deliver them to the village . . . the distance counts a lot so we cannot just take two IDs and go out for hours, you know. And it is not easy because the roads are bad. Yeah, so it is not something that we do regularly. It depends on the bulk of IDs that we have (Interview, 15 August 2001: Ms. January-Cekiso).

The Health Department division directly involved in the CSG is the maternity function. The key function of the health department is to conduct required immunizations and issue the Road to Health Card (RTHC) to all newborns. This card is a pre-requisite document for Home Affairs to process a child's birth certificate. And the birth certificate, in turn, is a pre-requisite for obtaining access to the CSG. One reason for the lack of access in Mount Frere is failure to obtain key requisite documents like the child's immunization card or the Road to Health card. In a study by the Health Systems Trust (HST) in 1997, the Road-to-Health card (RTHC), containing the child's immunisation dates and record of growth monitoring visits, could be produced by just over half of the caretakers (57%) of under fives (Islam, J. and McCoy, D. 1997: 12). Poor uptake statistics can also be attributed to the expectations of inadequate service provision among former Transkei residents. Due to the largely rural service area, the birthing function is *de facto* decentralized.¹⁹ There is a maternal and child health coordinator who works closely with welfare to ensure that the quality and range of services, including issuance of the requisite RTHC, meets the needs of the community.²⁰ The social work head of the Mount Frere office stressed that

The applications are not successful because they do not have the ID documents. That is the major problem. Others don't have the birth certificate because some people do not take their children to the clinic [after birth] and some of them they give birth at home so when the person now wants to apply for the grant she does not have a clinic card or an ID document (Interview, 7 August 2003: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu).

The frustrations with grant processing time echoed in the responses of interviewees. There was a universal complaint in all groups that the time between application and receipt was too long and inappropriate based on the needs of the people. One group participant challenged "why does welfare not do services like informing the people in the rural areas about the grants? Officers of welfare are always complaining about transport. Why don't they make other measures for that?" Another respondent was suspicious that the pay-out company (CPS) was "eating money" because her name was called but there was not money transferred. One woman that "when you apply for a grant it takes up to eight months and sometimes up to a year." The back pay system of paying benefit recipients from the date of application is designed to counter-balance the long turn around times through the central system yet one mother complained that she only received R270 in back pay even though she waited a year or eight months for

¹⁹ Therefore, there is the maternity ward of the two main area hospitals, Mary Therese and Sipeu, which delivers a minority of the babies born in the area because the majority of Mount Frere residents live far from these two facilities and there are no ambulances or regular/reliable medical transport.

²⁰ The Maternal and Child Health (MCH) coordinator is Matron Gogo.

the grant.²¹ These comments are representative of the well documented plight of rural black South Africans after the introduction of the new child support intervention (Budlender, D. 1998; Sogaula, N. et al. 2002; Samson, M. 2002).

Other access barriers fall into two main categories: physical barriers such as transportation and knowledge barriers. Transport barriers result from the remote residential locations of the poorest households in Mount Frere juxtaposed with the location of the office in the centre of town. This facilitates access in some ways because it is very accessible when applicants are in town, however, these does not occur as frequently for the poorest families. All groups registered dissatisfaction about the cost of accessing government assistance such as transport fees. One woman said that “it was difficult to go to all of the offices and apply” and that the office staff were always “talking nonsense,” a colloquialism for being rude. Knowledge barriers are exacerbated by the lack of adequate outreach which results from the lack of resources at the local office. Without adequate office transport or current outreach materials and without proper training for village chiefs and welfare committees, the dissemination of information about the grants is poor and unpredictable.

Knowledge of Rights

The new South African Constitution explicates a canopy of social and economic rights for all citizens which aim to democratise capabilities. This does not cover citizens who lack the civic knowledge to benefit from the promise of income security and social welfare. The evidence from interviews with the rural poor in Mount Frere reinforced that these progressive rights are institutionalised yet not actualised for a large subset of the population. The data collection for the ‘knowledge of rights’ sub-variable of social citizenship was measured based on the responses to questions probing the government’s perceived commitment to poverty alleviation and knowledge of the right to access government benefits.

The responses varied widely given the different social stratum assessed. At one extreme, there was a group conducted with the home village workers during a group meeting at the local social development office. While not employed by the government and often not educated formally past secondary school, this group of women had a more developed understanding of the social welfare landscape and more articulate views on the role of the state in poverty alleviation based on their work on poverty-related issues in the field. One village worker remarked that “the government requires the people to come out to the welfare office in order to assess problems in order to get government issues [benefits]. The government should be going out to the communities.” Another commented “we ask for money from the government to develop rural areas but we do not get a response.” Despite these negative sentiments there

²¹ Depending on when the application was made and how many children were claimed for the caregiver should have received between R800 (R100 x 8 months x 1 child) and R10,080 (R140 x 12 months x 6 children)

was universal agreement among the group of twenty home village workers that they trusted the government.

The groups conducted in the clinics with randomly selected citizens also exhibited an ambivalent attitude towards the government. Some women felt that the government (especially police and welfare) could not be trusted. They argued that the government “did nothing for their rights,” “they did not get money,” and that “they don’t have welfare officials going out to the rural areas to do workshops on the rights of the child and welfare grants.” Other respondents trusted the government because they were “processing their needs.” The group complained about the welfare officers because they were unresponsive to feedback and comments from clients.

The synopsis of the data collected indicates that there was a general acknowledgement that the government was committed to the eradication of poverty and the existence of maintenance grants; however, there was an under-developed understanding that the gap between dedication and action was a breach of fundamental rights. Therefore, the inadequacies of the system in Mount Frere were seen as problematic but only some saw these flaws as an unfulfilled entitlement. The ghost of apartheid era separate development strategies has enforced a lingering civic ethnic divide. The chasm is exhibited in a tiered understanding of how the new constitutional rights are expected to translate into a new generation of institutional arrangements and universal full citizenship.

Attitude Towards the Child Support Grant (CSG)

While some respondents interpreted the question as a subjective appraisal of the grant, others offered prospective comments. One respondent recommended increasing the value of the grant to “at least R300 per child because the whole family depends on the grant” while another said that “parents want to increase the grant to R200 because the R140 does not adequately cover groceries, school fees and other needs.” Yet another respondent wondered “why welfare does not collect orphans in rural areas to educate them and give them food. They are suffering and starving, they do not receive grants and they get no guidance. They need shelter.” Her comments infer that the attention on households with caregivers is short-sighted. These recommendations demonstrate a commitment to change but the lack of coordinated action uncovers a disconnect between ideas and productive engagement of rural citizens large due to the frustrations of poverty and under-development.

Another often cited concern was the irregularity and inconsistency of payments for the grant.²² One respondent stressed that poor administration and inconsistent turn around time caused conflict. She explained “when one person in the community gets the grant it causes problems with people who did not

²² It was not clear from the vagueness of comments whether the conflict of inconsistencies between family benefit profiles was due to different household sizes, the receipt of multiple grants, or mal-administration.

get a grant or whose grant is in process. This leads to fighting and mistrust of government.” Another participant demanded “we want to know why grants are different amounts and not equal. We feel that because of unequal amounts the government is creating a war within the communities because those who receive the lowest amount of money are the enemy of those who get higher amounts.”²³ However, the overwhelming sentiment of the case was captured in statements such as “if there was no grant we would have higher debts, we do not know what we would do” and that the child support grant “replaces the role of absentee fathers.”

Other groups commended welfare for its commitment to the grants but complained about the long turn around times and erratic pay outs. The negative comments centred around the issue of unequal benefit distribution. One woman remarked “I do not trust the government because the government has no backbone and causes fights.” Another respondent concurred that “the government can slaughter the people; the government does not care about the people.” They also alluded to the corruption of government officials (“they just help their friends”) as a reason why their expectations of the government efforts were low.

Attitudes towards the child support grant expressed in the focus groups were consistent with the negative responses to the government’s commitment to poverty alleviation, a right of citizenship, and towards grant accessibility. Specific comments about the grant were mixed. Experiences at the government offices were often negative.

The home village worker group touched on two major themes; namely, that the grant was better than nothing and that the amount was too small. The inability of families to send youth beneficiaries to school because of inaccessibly high school fees was seen as compelling evidence of the inadequacy of the grant in Mount Frere. Furthermore, the village workers reinforced a well documented fact²⁴ that “in many cases the entire family depends on the grant.”

Civic Engagement

The Afrobarometer household survey analysed a number of variables relating to civic engagement. In the rural Eastern Cape responses were used to create a picture of how civic engagement was expressed by the target groups for the Mount Frere case study.

²³ This comment is referring to the different amounts of benefit for different grants. There are higher transfers for the pension, disability, and foster care grants due to excessive costs for managing old age, disability and the school-going responsibilities defined in these programs. Furthermore, the amount received for the child support grant also varies depending on the number of children. This confusion is both an indication of lack of knowledge and of an attitude which advocates equality over prorated citizen benefits.

²⁴ See (Samson 2002), (Budlender 1998), and (May 1998a, 1998b).

The overarching trends in responses indicated a spectator oriented approach to civic life rather than an active and participatory sense of citizenship. For example, 61.3% of respondents felt that the country was going in the 'wrong direction,' however, a significant subset of respondents were apathetic about how to address social problems. For example, over 40% of respondents would 'do nothing' if there was a ban on the media (43.8%), a ban on judges (49.6%) or a suspension of parliament (46%). If there was a ban on political parties the majority of people were just as likely to do nothing (34.3%) as they were to talk to others (34.3%). In all four categories of democratic transgressions the second largest category of people reported that they would talk to others if these events occurred.²⁵

Discussion was the most common response demonstrating a very private sense of civic engagement rather than a public one. This is evidenced by responses to questions about discussing politics. 73% reported discussion politics with others occasionally and only 27% said that they never discuss politics with others. Moreover, 47.4% of respondents reported that they would address important problems affecting the community or country with others if they had the chance.

One of the ramifications of this private orientation is that besides attending rallies (40.9% of respondents had ever attended a rally) many categories of social action (such as addressing important concerns) would be engaged if an opportunity existed. Therefore, communities such as Mount Frere are pregnant with mobilization potential. For example, 38.7% of citizens would work for a politician, 39.4% would write a letter to a newspaper, a further 23.4 would attend a rally, 40.1% would attend a demonstration, and 32.8% would participated in a boycott. Disruptions of government proceedings and sit-ins were resoundingly unpopular as 60.6% and 90.5% would not participate even if they had the opportunity. And finally, anti-democratic government transgressions comparable to the events of the apartheid era were considered worthy of action by the majority of respondents. The largest category of action was talking to others but the third most popular response for all four offences was to join a march or demonstration.²⁶

Furthermore, many responses were a function of poverty and illiteracy rather than lack of interest and engagement. For example, 92.7% of citizens interviewed listened to the radio, while only 24.1% of respondents read the newspaper a few times per week or more. Only 7.3% of respondents had ever written a letter to a newspaper and only 38.7% watched television news at least a few times per week.

Civic engagement was difficult to assess through the qualitative data collection. However, there was a recurring theme of frustration with the non-responsiveness by government welfare officials. For example,

²⁵ 34.3% of respondents would talk to others if the media was banned. 21.9% would talk to others if judges were banned or censored. 34.3% would talk to others if political parties were banned and 25.5% would talk to others if parliament was suspended.

²⁶ For a ban of the media (14.6%), a ban on judges (16.1%), a ban on political parties (20.4%), and a suspension of parliament (17.5%) respondents were highly likely to join a march or demonstration and to make a public statement of disapproval.

one respondent complained that “the government was not responsive to the rural people’s suggestions to improve delivery such as reducing the identification documents into one.” This targeted feedback suggests that along with the expanding civil society arena in Mount Frere, the people are starting to stand up and demand client-centred service. However, there were significant client initiated movements to demand better services.

Unemployment

A major concern for Mount Frere is unemployment. This deficit remains high because the employment opportunities for the area are bleak. These unfavourable unemployment figures result in “. . . households heavily dependent on remittances and government support through social security” (Samson, M. 2002: 1154). A UN report conducted in 2000 found that unemployment had reached up to 93% in some districts of South Africa (Sunday Times 22 September 2002).²⁷ The focus and small group recipients were all unemployed except for the occasional temporary worker selling fruits on the main road. The more successful jobseekers relocated to urban areas such as East London, Cape Town and Johannesburg for sustainable employment to augment the meagre child support grant.

The interview respondents discussed the intersection between unemployment and social capital with regard to coping strategies. For instance, the Home Village Workers held that the reason why people depended on them rather than family or neighbours was because families and neighbours did not have any money. Furthermore, negative responses to questions about trust were intertwined with a commentary on the effect of economic instability and a surplus of dependence. Respondents made it clear that they were scrupulous about who to depend upon in financial shocks because the ubiquity of poverty caused people to act out of desperation rather than community. Therefore, the interview responses presented a different angle on the same problem. However, the driving message was the same—unemployment is a major problem for Mount Frere and similarly situated rural communities.

Independent Variable: Efficacy of Grant Administration

Descriptive Results

Through aggressive campaigning and targeted outreach in the communities and in highly frequented public and private areas such as hospitals, clinics, schools, and churches, the child support grant (CSG) has been receiving a significant amount of attention in Mount Frere. Nonetheless, severe resource deficits including outreach materials, adequate transport and infrastructure negate the positive effects of these campaigns and prevent administrative efficacy. The administrative problems are different in each department, however, there was a universal resource shortage which translated into under-staffing, a lack of adequate transportation, the over-extension and poor training of existing staff, and limited access to

²⁷ As cited in *The Sunday Times* 22 September 2002.

facilities such as telephones, computers, forms, office supplies, and fax machines. Eight out of the nine welfare department staff interviewed cited inadequate resources, including a lack of training, as a “major frustration” in their work (Elite Interview August 2001).

The grant application process took approximately three months *if all of the requisite documents are in order*, otherwise the processing time was subject to the bureaucratic inefficiency of the Health and Home Affairs departments where applicants must get requisite documents. Samson underscored the role of experience in facilitating successful application. While the reported take-up rate for the Child Support Grant was low, uptake was highest for recipients of other grants and lowest for first time beneficiaries. He reported that “the reasons cited by caregivers for failing to receive a Child Support Grant support the hypothesis of a link between positive previous experiences with social grant applications and successful qualification for a Child Support Grant” (Samson 2002: 1161-1162). Other possible explanations are that households in receipt of another grant have a higher disposable income which enables them to surmount access barriers such as transport and time. This statement suggests that grant accessibility is dependent upon household characteristics rather than administrative infrastructure in under-resourced areas like Mount Frere. Furthermore, this comment on the role of experience in successful grant application reinforces the link between social citizenship and administrative efficacy variables such as civic knowledge and accessibility.

The results also demonstrated that the documents issued by Home Affairs, particularly the birth certificate, did not reflect the reality of household structure in the service area. The Health function also has difficulty with the issuance of the RTHC due to the high volume of home births and the difficulty reaching mothers in remote locations for the vaccinations.

Finally, the hallmarks of effective program administration are penetration and impact. Given the under-development of the area it is unreasonable to expect an infusion of cash alone to translate into policy effects such as a decline in malnutrition and disease. This, however, is the implicit assumption of policy makers given the solitary emphasis on grant uptake rather than outcome for childhood development.

The two positive features of the Mount Frere case were the presence of inter-sectoral cooperation, a feature which developed significantly between 2001 and 2003 largely due to civil society interventions and negative media exposure, and the commitment of staff. As a result of the *Special Assignment* national news program on child malnutrition in Mount Frere a multi-sectoral team was established with representatives from the departments of Social Development, Home Affairs, and Health, and local town councillors. While initial momentum enabled the group to meet regularly and plan for improvements in service delivery, the same resource deficits that prevented efficacy administration thwarted optimal collaborative efforts. However, the EPRI study showed that the efforts to engage in inter-sectoral interventions were short-lived and displayed limited efficacy (Samson, M. 2002: 1163). Despite constant

and unrelenting pressure to serve the poor majority in Mount Frere, the staff at the welfare related offices throughout Mount Frere demonstrated a high level of commitment to help people in need despite frustrating working conditions.

Empirical Results

Staffing Adequacy

The size of the eligible population in Mount Frere is disproportionately large which strains staffing resources. All social security staff interviewed complained about short staffing and many felt that the lack of adequate staff contributed to poor local management. Social security clerks were responsible for grant intake, means testing, outreach, distribution of money, and management of cases. Social workers dealt exclusively with foster care grant applicants and case maintenance for abused children. Social workers were also concerned about a staff shortage. One complained, “the staff are overloaded so it is not easy to manage your cases because we are short staffed. And there is a lot of work to do. We have huge caseloads.” The social work head for the office confirmed “. . . there needs to be additional staff. There is not enough staff here. There must be additional staff because as you can see one social worker is coordinating four programs besides the areas she is doing” (Interview, 6 August 2001: Ms. Nkhalane). The excessive burden created by under-staffing at the local Social Development office disadvantaged both staff and clients. Procedural protocol and administrative principles like *Batho pele* were constrained by a lack of staff support.

The Mount Frere service area uses welfare committees to facilitate outreach and administration of the social welfare grants. The sub-district manager explained:

Some years ago . . . we decided to form the welfare committees so that they can be able to assist us . . .they collect information from their communities and they are of good help when there are pension pay-out days. They provide us with information about the deceased and their ID numbers so that they can be removed from the list . . .they also accompany people when they come to make applications for social security grants . . . [and] by informing us if there is someone . . . who is abusing a child . . . we are having 42 administrative areas in Mount Frere. And in each administrative area we are having welfare committees.” While the welfare committees are unpaid, loosely supervised, and lacking official recognition from the welfare administration they serve an essential function for social security grant administration (Interview, 7 August 2001: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu).

The welfare committees were an effective tool for community outreach given the dispersal of citizens and the extreme poverty of the most remote households in the service area. However, the resource deficit of the office inhibited the proper training and follow-up with the committees which would have otherwise enabled improved service delivery.

Grant Turn Around Time

The process of obtaining a child support grant is the same for all caregivers regardless of the relationship to the child. Take a single mother of six children with two children under the age of seven as an example. The first step is to visit the welfare office in Mount Frere on the intake day for your administrative area as advised by your welfare committee representative. This representative, if active, will inform potential applicants of the requirements for the grant application including obtaining a Road to Health card (RTHC) or birth certificate for the child, an ID book for the carer and proof of income for the household. The proof of income must prove that the carer is “not . . .in receipt of income in respect of the child/children” (Department of Social Development 2003:11-3).

The prospective applicant will produce copies of these documents to a social security clerk who will complete the application form for the client. “If one has not photocopies we do not just tell them to go and get photocopies . . .we are working with welfare committees . . . [applicants] are told [by the welfare committees] that they need photocopies and that they need this and this . . . everyone who is coming here has all of those” (Interview, 8 August 2001: Ms. Nongqayi). The application will then be processed by collecting all required documents, the means test will be applied and the application will be approved at the sub-district level. Applications for successful candidates will be forwarded on to the district office in Mount Ayliff to be processed by the data entry function and the account will be activated for payout. The data must be transported to the Mount Ayliff district office by car because there are no computers equipped with internet. Therefore, the transportation of forms happens on a weekly basis, weather permitting, rather than instantly which contributes to a longer backlog. Unsuccessful applicants will be notified and told why they did not qualify for the grant. Application processing time is subject to the bureaucratic (in)efficiency of the Health and Home Affairs departments and the lack of appropriate resources.

Facilities

The facilities varied for the two levels of Social Development serving Mount Frere. The Mount Ayliff district office is managed by a director for both social security and social workers. The office acts as a middle point between the sub-districts such as Mount Frere and the provincial office of Social Development. The office is better equipped with items such as telephones, computers, and printers. Therefore, all forms taken in at the sub-district offices are taken to the Mount Ayliff office and entered into the national database to activate pay out. There are plans to improve the infrastructure at the district office such as enhancing the stability of electrical and telecommunications cabling in order to enhance service delivery.

On the other hand, the Mount Frere sub-district office suffers from abysmal infrastructure and poor resource allocation with no immediate plans for improvement. The office also houses both the social security and social work functions. However, despite the local management of budgets and the proximity of the district office, the staff are inadequately equipped to meet the needs of the client base.²⁸ All office staff, including both social security clerks and social workers, shared one car, one computer and two telephones according to one social work official (Interview, 6 August 2001: Ms. Nkalane). While the social security staff needed transportation for outreach and managing pay points, the social workers were responsible for case maintenance and outreach on social programs which they administer. The execution of these tasks were hampered by poor resource allocation and inadequate facilities such as the lack of computers and transport. This arrangement was woefully inadequate given the demands of outreach, maintenance, and grant intake all conducted through the three dilapidated park homes off the main un-tarred road. This inadequacy is reflected in the feedback from staff on a survey conducted during the 2001 fieldwork. For example, one of the social workers suggested ways to improve the office and emphasized staff and resources. She asserted that “We need more staff and more cars because now we are sharing one car with the social security staff” (Interview, 14 August 2001: Ms. Thembeke Madikoua and Ms. Siyo Sibongile). The provincial head of social security acknowledged these same inadequacies.

The former head of social security at the Mount Frere sub-district office reported that staff in Mount Frere are dependent upon the Mount Ayliff office for computers to write reports or process forms (Interview, 8 August 2001: Ms. Nongqayi). The head of the social work arm explained that they relied on the Department of Health if the photocopier or phones were non-functional (Interview, 7 August 2001: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu). Non-functionality of the meagre resources was a common complaint for the instability of electricity and telecommunications in the area was compounded by under-developed infrastructure, poorly constructed buildings, and extreme weather conditions such as tornados and excessive rain and storming during the unrelenting rainy season.²⁹

The Mount Frere office for the Department of Home Affairs suffered the same resource deficits as welfare. There are inadequate resources such as staff, telecommunications, transport, and utility infrastructure to communicate effectively with the various branches of the department. The lack of reliable electricity to support the computers in the Mount Frere district offices impedes upon efficient processing time. One officer lamented: “Yeah, there are no computers and the problem is [*pause*] we do have computers the problem is with the electricity. The voltage is very low” (Interview, 15 August 2001: Ms. January-Cekiso).

The local health infrastructure serving Mount Frere, the third government arm of welfare provision, was at once better resourced and more constrained. Matron Gogo explained:

²⁸ Mount Ayliff is twenty five kilometers from Mount Frere on a tarred road

²⁹ The Mount Frere sub-district office is located in a series of park homes.

Deliveries are usually done at the hospital. The health centre in Tabankulu is doing more of the deliveries. Many areas are not very accessible. The central concern is safe deliveries. Now we are training traditional birth attendants (TBAs) to do safe deliveries in the most remote areas . . . The TBA lives in the community . . . There are mobile points [mobile health vans which go into remote communities once per month] for all medical problems which service the most remote areas. Mothers can get Road To Health cards at the mobile points (Interview, 3 August 2001: Matron Gogo).

There are roughly 17 clinics and in the health district which includes Mount Frere (Interview, 3 August 2001: Matron Gogo). Five of the Mount Frere clinics are in permanent structures and the other five are in temporary structures, the other seven clinics service the Mount Ayliff area (Interview, 3 August 2001: Matron Gogo). All clinics do deliveries, and eight of the ten in Mount Frere are 24-hour facilities, while two are day clinics functioning from 8:00AM to 5:00PM every day (Interview, 3 August 2001: Matron Gogo). The Health Department facilities are often used to fill the gaps in resources for other departments in Mount Frere such as Welfare and Home Affairs. Therefore, the resource deficits encountered by the Health offices reverberate throughout the system and cause delays in the distribution of social welfare grants. For instance, back logs in the dissemination of the Road to Health card due to stationary shortages or lack of staff are one of the main impediments to receiving the child grants.

Appropriate Training

Staff are trained locally by the office heads at the sub-district and district levels. According to the sub-district office manager “We are training them, it used to be the regional office, now they are trained at the district office” (Interview, 7 August 2001: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu). On-going training is hampered by the lack of transport, staffing, and telecommunications, however, staff are briefed on major changes and updates to policy. The head of social work at the Mount Frere office stressed the need for the training to go beyond policy and administrative protocol. She suggested “Also, the social security personnel need to be trained in customer care” (Interview, 6 August 2001: Ms. Nkalane). This comment infers that *Batho pele* is a learned rather than indigenous principle. Areas such as Mount Frere suffer from a lack of training and support which constrains their ability to effectively serve their public.

Inter-Sectoral Cooperation

Government dominates the social welfare service provider landscape in Mount Frere with the assistance of a few non-governmental organizations. One of the main purveyors of social services in Mount Frere is the provincial government via social security grants and poverty alleviation programs. Other departments

such as health are also actively involved with the administration of the child support grant. In fact, there is a social worker stationed in the hospital one day per week for assistance. Ms. Mlandu, the sub-district manager, explained:

There is a social worker here who is providing services [once a week to the hospitals] but sometimes when there is a problem they phone to say what is wrong. So there is a big inter-sectoral collaboration. Ever since we started working on inter-sectoral collaboration. The nurses inform us when there is a problem at the maternity ward or whatever because we are supposed to go for the client and to help with social problems. There is also inter-sectoral collaboration with the magistrate, the dept of agriculture, education, the police, sports/arts/culture, local government . . . (Interview, 7 August 2001: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu).

Other organizations which serve comparable functions in the realm of household health provision and poverty alleviation include clinics such as Mntwana in Tabankulu and Sinosizo, a regional organization based in Durban with an office in Mount Frere. However, the lack of advocacy organizations at the local and provincial levels limits the role of non-governmental agencies in policy creation and regulation. There are efforts being made national campaigns such as the Alliance for Children's Entitlement to Social Security (ACCESS) to use the research conducted on remote and under-developed areas such as Mount Frere to affect policy change but the gap between the local and the national leaves many people behind.

The local government authority is not well established nor does it serve a significant welfare function. Instead it exists on the periphery of national and provincial programs as an advocate and facilitator. One civil society member recommended that I "talk to the local government officials because they *should* know about the grants and educate the public" (Interview, 3 August 2001: Ms. Mpikwa). However, the welfare office is more likely to partner with traditional leadership, or village chiefs, than with local town councillors due to historically entrenched citizen allegiances and residential arrangements. The public outcry about child malnutrition and the inefficacy of the child support grant in rural under developed areas such as Mount Frere has led to cross-sectoral linkages in training and outreach. Officials and staff anticipate further improvements. Although they admit that current efforts are retarded by the same constraints which prevent effective service delivery.

Alternative examples of inter-sectoral cooperation include welfare committees, outreach strategies, and civil society support. The Mount Frere sub-district manages over forty administrative areas each with a welfare committee whose members work on a volunteer basis to improve the outreach and administration for the grants and pay-outs. The welfare committees are an effective tool for community outreach given the dispersal of citizens and the extreme poverty of the most remote households in the service area. However, the resource deficit of the office inhibits proper training and follow-up with committees which

would otherwise enable better service execution. In addition, the welfare department has difficulty with the welfare committee representatives because, due to their voluntary status, they often fail to prepare area residents for the eligibility and application requirements for the grants.

. . . These welfare committees are not paid so it is difficult for us to say this is a capable person to take the person to be a welfare committee [member] because that person is not paid . . . the fact that they are not paid leads to corruption and lack of cooperation because when they started they reported many cases of deceased persons who were getting paid and I don't know if they thought they were going to be paid because they were working very hard and now they are not reporting because they are not being paid (Interview: 15 August 2001: Ms. Sompeta).

Therefore, even if one is able to service an isolated village the quality of service they receive is sub-standard and often out-dated. However, as with social grant delivery, the under-resourced devolution of the welfare function, poor inter- and intra-sectoral coordination, and mired communication act as hindrances to effective outreach as well.

The inter-sectoral cooperation was accompanied by a lack of trust and sensitivity for the partner departments. For instance, the head of social security at the Mount Frere office complained:

Last year there were a lot of child support grants. Home Affairs had computers, the computer were done in a day But we experience a problem, they have to wait three, four months to get their birth certificate because they cannot process them here in Mount Frere, they must process them in Umtata and it takes long. 'Til last year they were processing them here. So we see less applications because of the problems with documents because people are waiting a long time to get a birth certificate because they have no computers here (Interview, 8 August 2001: Ms. Nongqayi).

This scenario demands a more aggressive and efficient approach to arming the area residents with the required documentation to benefit from the constitutionally endowed entitlements of citizenship. The sub-district manager had reiterated this concern:

Yes, we used to work with Home Affairs, but we are having problems with them. Because they are so stripped. I am not sure if this comes from the national department. This department of Home Affairs gets things from the national level. So, they are so strict. Sometimes you go there and come back without being helped having spent so much time talking and then you come back with no document (Interview, 7 August 2001: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu).

However, this process is hindered by severe resource deficits in the Mount Frere service area.

Commitment of Staff

The *Batho pele* ethos pervades the administrative culture in Mount Frere. “The government wants us to use a new mantra ‘people first’ so we must try to do everything to our best. All of them [staff] they are trying their best to meet the basic needs of the clients” (Interview, 7 August 2001: Ms. Yolisa Mlandu). However, this effort only holds true when there are is an adequate telecommunications infrastructure to support the enhanced communication potential. These sentiments were echoed by the social workers:

I think we would be proud of our jobs if we had all of the facilities, I mean it is interesting and it is nice to visit the areas and help people with problems even if the client comes in we try to help the client however we can but because of the problems we are having like documents that they do not have and it takes them a long time to apply for them it is not easy to say that you are really helping them. But the job is interesting, it is just really frustrating (Interview, 14 August 2001: Ms. Thembeke Madikuo and Ms. Siyo Sibongile).

During the interview with the Mount Frere-based district social security manager there was a steady stream of interruptions from social workers using the office telephone as the six social work staff share one telephone to conduct all business. The telephone in the district manager’s office is the only other telephone on site. In the case of Mount Frere doing “their best to meet the basic needs of the clients” is hampered by a lack of phones, unreliable and irregular postal service and inadequate transport.

Discussion

This paper will conclude with a discussion of the relevance and impact of the Mount Frere case upon the overarching research query.

Data Analysis

Many of the problems with grant administration which are documented in the Mount Frere care are the result of poor physical and social infrastructure. These barriers are deeply rooted in the colonial, imperial and apartheid past of the former Transkei region. Furthermore, media, civil society and government interventions which occurred between the two data collection periods had a significant effect on the responses of government officials and citizens. These spurious factors required a reconsideration of the independent and dependent variables as the question of how the two variables are related became a

moving target. The ineptitude of former homeland officials and the historical lack of physical and administrative resources resulted in severe under-development in rural areas such as Mount Frere.

Dependent Variable <i>Social Citizenship</i>	1 = Poor
Unemployment	0
Attitude Towards CSG	0
Civic Engagement (see AB)	0
Social Capital	1
Knowledge of Rights	0
Accessibility of Grant	0
Independent Variable <i>Efficacy of Grant Administration</i>	2 = Poor
Staffing Adequacy	0
Commitment of Staff	1
Facilities	0
Training	0
Grant Turn Around Time	0
Inter-sectoral Cooperation	1

Table 1 Binary Coding for the Mount Frere Case Study

Many of the disadvantages of being poor in Mount Frere, and in the Eastern Cape province more generally, stem from the looming apartheid past. The correlations between under-development, remoteness and poverty are highly relevant to the Eastern Cape case study. The Eastern Cape Province houses two former homelands, and as a result, the provincial government structure is severely disadvantaged by a dearth of administrative competence. This inefficacious arrangement is reflected in the comments of citizens who reside in the most remote and under-served areas of this poorly managed province.³⁰

It is clear from the coinciding low levels of administrative efficacy and low levels of social citizenship demonstrated by Table 1 that there is a dire need to progressively redress the injustices of the past in order to actualize the constitutional promise of a different tomorrow. For the Mount Frere case the relationship between training and commitment was not indivisible as other cases might suggest. The case study found that the presence of social capital is not embedded in other aspects of social citizenship. However, the presence of social capital for the Boolean binary analysis fails to represent the gradations of outcome for the sub-variable. For on a scale of one to ten, the sub-variable would have scored a six; whereas on a (0,1) scale it scored a '1.' Finally, while Mount Frere is the worst off in terms of the dependent variable it is not the worst off in terms of the independent variable, which one can argue demonstrates the positive impact of media and civil society intervention but defies the efficacy of these interventions. Therefore

³⁰ During the course of this research, a significant change in the administrative competence of officials with replacements by the Premier and national government has also intervened. There are plans in place to infuse large amounts of cash and expertise to the province due to complaints about mal-administration of grants and corruption.

this finding suggests that social citizenship is a personal or private good which is facilitated but not defined by government or civil society interventions.

While the Boolean analysis discussed in Chapter Seven of the forthcoming doctoral thesis *A Dream Deferred: Social Citizenship and Social Security in Post Apartheid South Africa* by Waddell provides a more robust understanding of how the different factors identified interact to define the dependent variable in each of the four cases, the underlining point is clear—the actualization of social rights of South African citizenship are severely circumscribed by the lack of efficacy in the administration of the child support grant in rural communities such as Mount Frere. This predictably alarming truth rings out for a reinvigorated struggle to end apartheid for all South African citizens.

Implications

Internal migration from resource poor rural areas such as Mount Frere to resource rich urban areas such as Cape Town or Johannesburg is a common short term solution to a structural problem. The majority of the urban townships residents are migrants from the rural areas. These men and women come in search of temporary or permanent jobs in all sectors, although they are most often relegated to the insecure and vulnerable informal sectors with temporary and unstable labour. The majority of the money earned returns to the source community through remittances and the remainder goes to support new lifestyles and needs often related to vulnerability and stress of migrant life such as drinking, violence, and disease related health expenses. A study by the Institute for Social and Economic Research (ISER) noted the effect of cultural distinctions between rural and urban dwellers upon migration. One respondent stated:

I prefer staying in a peaceful, quiet and secure rural environment where my morals and dignity will not be undermined. Here (in an urban area) we live in an insecure, absolutely non-private, immoral life where there is always noise and quarrels, especially over weekends when people are drunk. For me, the urban society will remain irrelevant except insofar as it can still allow me a chance to make a living for the benefit of my rural family (Manona, C., Bank, L. and Higginbottom, K. 1995: 34).

Many migrants experience distrust and unwelcome receptions from the destination communities despite relatives and friends because new migrants take jobs and services from the more permanent residents. However, one Cape Town based participant in the 1998 Speak Out on Poverty Hearings explained his sympathetic understanding of how unemployment fuelled migration, even when migrants did not expect to find a decent home or job: “Eastern Cape people believe there is work in the Western Cape, hence the proliferation of shacks. Every Monday, the bus comes from the Eastern Cape and many disembark” (Budlender, D. 1998: 21).

Likewise, political stability is undermined by the dissatisfaction of rural residents and the dire circumstances which result from the downward spiral of chronic disease, unemployment, and lack of capital (human, social, and financial). The disempowerment of the area residents will delay a serious breach of stability, but it cannot neutralize this looming threat without an urgent augmentation of capital, infrastructure, competence, and substantive citizenship. If accompanied by an enhancement in social infrastructure and administrative capacity the empowerment of the South African people can lead to a robust and durable democracy.

Works Cited

- Budlender, D. (1998). *Poverty and Human Rights: National Speak Out on Poverty Hearings, March to June 1998*. Pretoria: Government Printers
- Department of Social Development. (2003). *Social Assistance Procedural Manual*.
- Health Systems Trust. (1997). *Health and Health Care in Mount Frere*. ISDS Technical Report 2c.
- IDASA. 1999. "Quarterly Sectoral Report: Welfare." *Budget Brief*, Issue 20. Cape Town: IDASA.
- Irlam, J. and McCoy, D. (1998). *Community Research as a Springboard for District: A Household Survey of Maternal and Child Health in the Mount Frere Health District, 1997*. ISDS Technical Report No. 7.
- Makan B, Morar R, McIntyre D. (1997). *DHS Development in the Eastern Cape Province: District Financing and Financial Management Capacity; District Financing in Support of Equity. Final Report*. Cape Town: Health Economics Unit.
- Manona, C., Bank, L. and Higginbottom, K. (1995). *Gender, Households and Environmental Changes in Informal Settlements in the Eastern Cape Province, South Africa*. Grahamstown: Institute of Social and Economic Research, Rhodes University
- Mattes, R., Bratton, M., and Davids, Y. D. (2003). "Poverty, Survival and Democracy in Southern Africa." Afrobarometer Working Paper Series No. 23.
- May, Julian (ed.) 1998a. *Poverty and Inequality Report in South Africa*. Durban: Praxis Publishing.
- May, J. 1998b. *Experience and Perceptions of Poverty in South Africa*. Durban: Praxis.
- Samson, M. 2002. "HIV/AIDS and Poverty in Households with Children Suffering from Malnutrition: The Role of Social Security in Mount Frere." *The South African Journal of Economics* 70: 7: December 2002.
- Sogaula, N., van Niekerk, R., Noble, M., Waddell, J., Green, C., Sigala, M., Samson, M., Sanders, D., and Jackson, D. (2002). Social Security Transfers, Poverty and Chronic Illness in the Eastern Cape. An Investigation of the Relationship Between Social Security Grants, the Alleviation of Rural Poverty and Chronic Illnesses: A Case Study of Mount Frere in the Eastern Cape. Economic Policy Research Unit and the Social Disadvantage Research Centre, Department of Social Policy and Social Work, University of Oxford and School of Public Health, University of the Western Cape.
- Sunday Times 22 September 2002.
- Taylor, Vivienne. 2002. *Transforming the Present-Protecting the Future*. Pretoria: Government Printers
- UNDP (1998). *HIV/AIDS and Human Development in South Africa 1998*. Pretoria: Amabhuku Publications.
- Zunga, S., Moitse, S., and Hosegood, V. (2003). "Beating a Path Through the Maze of Bureaucracy." *ChildrenFIRST* 7 (46).
- Telephone interview*
4 September 2001: Ms. Dekeda
- In Person Interviews*
3 August 2001: Matron Gogo
3 August 2001: Ms. Mpikwa

6 August 2001: Ms. Nkalane
7 August 2001: Ms. Y. Mlandu
8 August 2001: Ms. Nongqayi
14 August 2001: Ms. T. Madikuo and Ms. S. Sibongile
15 August 2001: Ms. January-Cekiso
15 August 2001: Ms. Sompeta